



Regular Meeting Minutes

September 18, 2018 – 10:00 A.M.-12:00 P.M.

Rio Salado College – Conference Center, North Room (2nd Floor)

Members

Joel Hauff, University of Arizona, Chair- Arizona Board of Regents (ABOR)	X
Janelle Elias, Rio Salado College- Arizona Community College Coordinating Council (AC4)	X
Patricia Feldman, Arizona State University- Arizona Board of Regents (ABOR)	X
Matthew Gidley, Northern Arizona University- Arizona Board of Regents (ABOR)	X
Michael Amick, Pima Community College- Arizona Community College Coordinating Council (AC4)	X
Teri Stanfill, Arizona State Board for Private Postsecondary Education (AZPPSE)	X
Stacey Hilton, Yavapai College- Arizona Community College Coordinating Council (AC4)	X
Jennifer Lech, Grand Canyon University - Arizona State Board for Private Postsecondary Education (AZPPSE)	X
Paul Mittman, Southwest College of Naturopathic Medicine & Health Sciences- Arizona State Board for Private Postsecondary Education (AZPPSE)	-

Others Present

Lanna Dueck, AZ SARA Council Executive Director	X
---	---

I. CALL TO ORDER: Chairman Hauff called the meeting to order at 10:00 A.M.

II. CALL TO THE PUBLIC: Public input is encouraged. *Presentations must be limited to five minutes. In order to complete the agenda, the Chair may limit the number of speakers at any given meeting. Please be aware, however, that the Council may not discuss, consider or take action at this meeting on any item not appearing on its Agenda.*

Chairman Hauff opened the call to the Public. No individuals from the public were present at the meeting.

III. COUNCIL MEETING MINUTES

MAY 15, 2018 MEETING MINUTES: Chairman Hauff introduced the minutes. Approved as submitted.

Motion to Approve: Ms. Elias
Second: Ms. Hilton
Vote: 8-0-0

IV. INSTITUTIONAL RENEWALS

- A. PENN FOSTER COLLEGE:** Penn Foster was represented by Connie Dempsey, Chief Certification and Licensing Officer; James Baker, Controller; Heather McAllister, General Counsel; Rebecca McGovern, Director of Regulatory Compliance; and Joanna Johnson, Senior Regulatory Coordinator. Ms. McAllister explained that Bain Capital Double Impact Fund (BCDI) acquired Penn Foster from Vistria and Falcon on April 30, 2018. Ms. Stanfill indicated the institution is approved by the State Board with quarterly reporting and a fifty-thousand-dollar bond. Mr. Amick requested clarification on the rationale for having a third party CPA review the institution's submitted composite score. Ms. Dueck explained that as the institution is not Title IV participating, the CPA provides an independent verification of the institution's score. Ms. Feldman questioned as to the impact of the change of ownership on current programs. Ms. McGovern responded that the institution currently has two Bachelor degrees, twenty Associate degrees and a handful of Certificate programs, with the most enrollment in the Associates in Veterinarian Technology, none of which have been changed as a result of the new ownership. Ms. McAllister added the change of ownership resulted in no staffing or operational changes at the institution.

Motion to Approve: Mr. Amick
Second: Ms. Feldman
Vote: 7-0-0

- B. ARIZONA CHRISTIAN COLLEGE:** Dr. Edward Clavell, Director of Online Studies, represented the institution. Ms. Hilton requested an update on the two remaining HLC concerns from the institution's accreditation review. Dr. Clavell indicated the institution hired two additional faculty and it is in the process of hiring additional faculty personnel. He also stated the institution implemented ongoing assessment reports, inclusive of a rolling five-year strategic plan, that incorporates budget planning. Mr. Hauff requested clarification on the nature of the faculty concerns. Dr. Clavell reported it was a student-to-faculty ratio issue rather than a qualifications issue. Dr. Lech inquired as to the outsourcing of online material and Dr. Clavell indicated the institution is no longer outsourcing, currently uses Canvas, and has hired personnel to develop its online programs. Ms. Stanfill stated the institution holds a three hundred-thousand-dollar bond with the State Board and submits quarterly electronic student records.

Motion to Approve: Dr. Lech
Second: Mr. Gidley
Vote: 7-0-0

- C. BROOKLINE COLEGE:** Mr. Matthew Egan, Chief Compliance Officer, represented the institution. Ms. Stanfill indicated the institution holds a \$2.3 million bond with the State Board and is on quarterly reporting. Mr. Egan indicated the institution continues to address the accreditation-focused issues of significant management turn-over and student placement concerns within certain programs. Dr. Lech inquired as to the number of online students to which Mr. Egan responded the institution has approximately two hundred online students across ten to twelve programs.

Motion to Approve: Ms. Hilton

Second: Dr. Lech

Vote: 7-0-0

- D. CENTRAL ARIZONA COLLEGE:** Ms. Sylvia Gibson, Interim Executive Director of Intuitional Planning, Research, and Effectiveness; and Ms. Terri Ackland, Academic Dean, represented the institution. Ms. Feldman inquired as to whether the three-year strategic plan impacted current programs. Ms. Gibson stated that while some course level curriculum has been updated there have been no major changes to programs. Ms. Feldman requested the number of online students and Ms. Ackland indicated approximately ten percent of total enrollments.

Motion to Approve: Ms. Elias

Second: Mr. Amick

Vote: 7-0-0

- E. COCONINO COMMUNITY COLLEGE:** Dr. Gonzalo Perez, Associate Provost; and Mr. Luke Owens, Distance Education and Library Services Manager, represented the institution. Dr. Gonzalo provided updates on the institution including the development of a template for online courses with one hundred percent faculty adoption, a twenty percent increase in enrollment and additional positions in faculty support personnel. Ms. Elias inquired as to online enrollment to which Dr. Gonzalo indicated it is approximately thirty percent of total enrollments at 1,120 enrollments. The institution is currently developing its online AGEC, Phycology/Sociology, and Business programs and is already fully approved to offer online programs by the Higher Learning Commission. Responding to an accreditation question from Ms. Hilton, Dr. Gonzalo indicated the institution submitted its interim report to the HLC with no follow-up required.

Motion to Approve: Dr. Lech

Second: Ms. Feldman

Vote: 7-0-0

- F. EASTERN ARIZONA COLLEGE:** Dr. Janice Lawhorn, Dean of Curriculum and Instruction; and Mr. Greg Watson, Director for the Center of Teaching and Learning, represented the institution. Dr. Lawhorn discussed the institution's Higher Learning Commission interim report which focused on the institution's efforts to enhance its Diversity and Inclusion

program. In response to this, the institution created the Diversity and Inclusion Committee and added diversity and inclusion throughout its General Education courses. The institution also welcomed a new President, Mr. Todd Haynie, in May of 2018.

Motion to Approve: Ms. Hilton

Second: Ms. Stanfill

Vote: 7-0-0

- G. PIMA COMMUNITY COLLEGE:** Mr. Amick represented the institution. As a participant of the Higher Learning Commission's (HLC) Pathway program the institution moved to full implementation this fall. Also, online enrollments increased ten percent this year and an additional ten percent last year, resulting in a twenty percent overall increase. The Achieve a Dream Open Educational Resource initiative is believed to be a significant contributor to this increase. In response to Ms. Feldman's question regarding the upcoming HLC visit, Mr. Amick indicated the institution is focused on assessment and the online campus visit.

Motion to Approve: Dr. Lech

Second: Mr. Gidley

Vote: 6-0-1

- H. SOUTHWEST INSTITUTE OF HEALING ARTS:** Mr. Brad Boute represented the institution. The institution's online enrollment experienced a slight decline mainly related to the institution's removal of the Associates of Occupational Studies from its offerings due to low enrollment and retention. The institution's highest enrolled online programs are the Holistic Wellness Practitioner and the Integrative Arts Practitioner. Mr. Boute also indicated that the institution has five accreditation issues to report to its accreditor, the Accrediting Council for Continuing Education and Training in October. He anticipates all but the retention issue to be resolved in the report.

Motion to Approve: Ms. Hilton

Second: Ms. Stanfill

Vote: 7-0-0

- I. UNIVERSITY OF ADVANCING TECHNOLOGY:** Ms. Valerie Cimarosa represented the institution. Ms. Hilton inquired as to whether the institution was completely online. Ms. Cimarosa explained that the institution has a campus in Tempe with in-person classes and also offers online courses/programs. Mr. Hauff commended the institution on its educational technology offerings and innovations.

Motion to Approve: Ms. Stanfill

Second: Mr. Amick

Vote: 7-0-0

- J. YAVAPAI COLLEGE:** Ms. Hilton represented the institution and indicated there are numerous happenings at the institution including continued work on the Higher Learning Commission's (HLC) Pathways program, the launch of the First Year Academy with a tuition freeze until graduation, a Quality Matters review on all online courses, the

current President retiring and new Presidential hire and two Governing Board members up for election. Additionally, the institution has an interim HLC report due in December addressing assessment practices among differing modalities. Dr. Lech inquired as to the HLC Year 4 virtual visit and Ms. Hilton explained it is HLC's new process where all review materials are submitted into HLC's online system and the review is conducted virtually with no in-person team visit.

Motion to Approve: Ms. Elias

Second: Dr. Lech

Vote: 6-0-1

V. NEW APPLICANT

- A. PHOENIX SEMINARY:** Mr. Joshua Anderson, Dean of Students and Assistant Dean for Distance Education, represented the institution. He explained that the institution is dually accredited with the Higher Learning Commission (HLC) and the Association of Theological Schools. Total enrollment is approximately two hundred and eighty students. The institution's primary program is its Masters in Divinity which is not offered online. The Masters in Counseling is the institution's online program and its only program approved by the Arizona State Board for Private Postsecondary Education (AZPPSE) as all other programs fall under religious exemption. The institution has eight fulltime faculty for both on-ground and online programming. Mr. Amick questioned whether the institution is following Quality Matters (QM) in its development of its online offerings. Mr. Anderson indicated the institution is looking into QM for quality standards as it recently learned of the program through its most recent HLC visit.

Motion to Approve: Dr. Lech

Second: Ms. Elias

Vote: 7-0-0

VI. EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR'S REPORT

- A. BUDGET UPDATE:** The budget was presented to the Council in meeting materials. Current total fees accrued this fiscal year is \$0 as September is the first cycle in the fiscal year. Expenses incurred in current FY to date total \$31,248 with a balance of \$381,082. Ms. Dueck highlighted a minor update to the reporting format that results in a clearer and easier to read report.
- B. ARIZONA SARA COUNCIL FEE REDUCTION REVIEW:** A revised version of the May draft fee reduction schedule was submitted to the Council by Mr. Hauff and Ms. Dueck projecting various reduction options. The specific goal remains alignment with NC SARA's three- tiered structure from the Arizona SARA Council's current four-tiered structure, while also providing the most equitable fee reduction, inclusive of the NC SARA fee, to all current Arizona SARA participating institutions. Option Two was recommended to the Council. Council discussion indicated agreement that it was the

most all-around equitable reduction while sufficiently supporting current Arizona SARA operations. Mr. Hauff and Ms. Dueck will coordinate the reduction with institutions.

Motion to Approve: Dr. Lech

Second: Ms. Elias

Vote: 7-0-0

- C. STUDENT COMPLAINTS:** Ms. Dueck provided the Council members with a summary of complaints received. Two new complaints were documented as of the last Council meeting. No complaints constituted review by the Council per NC SARA policy.
- D. NC SARA UPDATES:** California and Massachusetts remain the only two non-SARA states. Ms. Dueck provided an update on the W-SARA physical presence work-team progress. In response to Objective Three, Arizona submitted two entries from Arizona SARA participating private institutions to provide more adequate representation of private institutions on the NC SARA Board as Board membership is predominately representative of public institutions. NC SARA currently has one Board seat open. Candidates will be reviewed at NC SARA's November Board meeting. For Objective Four, John Lopez drafted language that clarifies NC SARA's process on policy recommendations and adoption and specifically participating institution's role in policy development. This new language will also be reviewed at the NC SARA November Board meeting. This concludes the work of the work-team.
- E. ARIZONA STATE SARA RENEWAL APPLICATION:** Arizona State's portal entity renewal application is due to be reviewed by the W-SARA Steering Team at its October 2018 meeting. The renewal application was signed by Mr. Hauff, Arizona SARA Chair. Ms. Dueck anticipates Arizona's renewal will be approved by W-SARA and NC SARA for continued SARA participation. State portal entities are reviewed and renew with SARA every two years.
- F. ARIZONA SARA COUNCIL 2019 MEETING DOODLE:** Ms. Dueck informed the Council that a Doodle to create the Council's 2019 calendar will be coming out shortly and requested Council members respond to it promptly.
- G. NEXT COUNCIL MEETING:**
1.15.2019 @ 1:00 P.M. INSTITUTIONS UP FOR RENEWAL

 - I. ACACIA UNIVERSITY
 - II. SOUTHWET COLLEGE OF NATUROPATHIC MEDICINE

VII. ADJOURNMENT: The Meeting of the Arizona SARA Council Adjourned at 12:02 P.M.